



**Notice of meeting of  
Education Scrutiny Committee**

**To:** Councillors Kirk (Chair), Brooks (Vice-Chair), Alexander, Gunnell, Hyman, Merrett and Morley

Co-opted Statutory Members:

Mr John Bailey (Parent Governor Representative) and Dr David Sellick (Church of England Representative)

**Date:** Tuesday, 30 October 2007

**Time:** 5.00 pm

**Venue:** The Guildhall, York

**AGENDA**

**1. Declarations of Interest**

At this point Members are asked to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they may have in the business on this agenda. A list of general personal interests previously declared are attached.

**2. Minutes (Pages 1 - 2)**

To approve and sign the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee, held on 11 September 2007.

**3. Public Participation**

At this point in the meeting members of the public who have registered their wish to speak regarding an item on the agenda or an issue within the Committee's remit can do so. Anyone who wishes to register or requires further information is requested to contact the Democracy Officer on the contact details listed at the foot of this agenda. The deadline for registering is **Monday, 29 October 2007, at 5:00 pm.**

#### **4. Governing Bodies Review (Pages 3 - 16)**

This report presents a proposed remit for the scrutiny topic on the role of School Governors, as agreed at the meeting on 11 September, and invites Members to agree a way forward for this review.

#### **5. Urgent Business**

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972

#### Democracy Officer:

Name: Fiona Young

Contact details:

- Telephone – (01904) 552027
- E-mail – [fiona.young@york.gov.uk](mailto:fiona.young@york.gov.uk)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports

Contact details are set out above.

City of York Council

Minutes

---

MEETING	EDUCATION SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE	11 SEPTEMBER 2007
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS KIRK (CHAIR), ALEXANDER, GUNNELL, HYMAN, MERRETT, WISEMAN (SUBSTITUTE), MR J BAILEY AND DR D SELICK
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLORS BROOKS AND MORLEY

---

**12. Declarations of Interest**

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business agenda.

The following general personal non-prejudicial interests were declared:

Councillor Hyman as chair of governors at Huntington Primary School.

Dr D Sellick as a governor of Derwent Infant and Junior School.

Mr J Bailey as a governor of Huntington School and Huntington Primary School.

**13. Minutes**

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 18 July 2007 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

**14. Public Participation**

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

**15. Possible Education Scrutiny Topics**

Members discussed the possibility of a new scrutiny topic, The Role of School Governors. To help make a decision Members received a presentation from the Governance Services Manager, which covered the following:

- The Role of Governors
- School Governor Training Programme
- Service Agreement
- National Benchmarking of Governor Services
- Clerking Service

- Support for Governors

Members discussed in detail possible valuable areas for review within this specific topic. They also heard from the Executive Member for Children's Services who attended the meeting to identify potential useful areas for Scrutiny review. The Executive Member endorsed proposals for undertaking a review of the Role of School Governors, particularly with regard to extended schools and the joint area review coming up in January 2008.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) It was agreed to report back to the next meeting with a potential remit for reviewing the topic relating to School Governors as originally registered by the former Cllr Kind.
  - (ii) To seek authority from the Scrutiny Management Committee to incur appropriate expenditure on undertaking a suitable survey as part of a consultative process associated with the review.
  - (iii) To report back to an early meeting of the Committee with details of a proposed survey and associated costs.
  - (iv) To invite the Executive Member for Children's Services to periodically attend future meetings to discuss beneficial Scrutiny reviews.

- REASON:
- (i) To ensure any decision on whether to proceed with a review is fully informed.

CLLR M KIRK

Chair of Scrutiny Committee

The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 6.30 pm.



## Education Scrutiny Committee

30 October 2007

### Governing Bodies Review

#### Purpose of Report

1. The purpose of the report is to present the proposed remit to Members and agree a way forward for this review.

#### Background

2. In May 2005 Cllr Kind registered a topic on the role of School Governors and in October 2006 this committee received a feasibility report on this topic. At that time, it was suggested that Children's Services EMAP receive a report on the ever changing level of responsibility associated with the role of Governor, but this did not happen.
3. This topic was reconsidered at a meeting of this Committee in July 2007, and Members agreed to receive a presentation from the Governance Services Manager at their next meeting. On 11 September 2007 this presentation was given and Members agreed to undertake a review of the Role of School Governors, and asked that a potential remit be presented for consideration at this meeting – see Annex A.
4. It is recognised that this review fits with the following eligibility criteria:
  - i. Public Interest (i.e. in terms of proposals being both in the public interest and resident perceptions)
  - ii. Service Efficiency

#### Timetable For Review

5. Having regard to the objectives within the proposed remit and the consultation methods identified, it is suggested that this review will require a timeframe of six months. With this in mind, the following timetable is presented for consideration:

Meeting Date	Consultation Activities & Events
30 October 07	Consideration of scoping report and proposed remit
05 December 07	To consider draft survey before it is issued and identify any additional information to be sought
09 January 08	Consideration of Objective No.3
26 February 08	Consideration of Objective No.4
15 April 08	Consider survey results, and agree recommendations
27 May 2008	Consideration of final draft report

## Consultation

### i) To investigate the current composition of governing bodies in an effort to find ways of improving the ethnicity balance and chairing skills of panel members

6. The Governance Service Manager has provided information on the current composition of governing bodies showing the different categories of governors, the number of each type per school, where there are vacancies and which category these vacancies fall within – see Annex B.
7. Annex C provides information on the different governor categories and who is responsible for recruiting these. It also identifies the support given by the Governance Service team to schools when trying to fill governing body vacancies.
8. In order to improve the ethnicity balance of governing bodies it will first be necessary to identify the current balance. With this in mind, a survey of governors is planned for January 2008, under the guise of getting the Governance Service database up to date. Prior to this being sent out, this committee will have an opportunity to feed into it to ensure it captures all of the relevant information to fully inform this review.

### ii) To identify ways of increasing the number of community Governors

9. On the whole the Local Authority does not have a problem recruiting their governors. However, some schools experience problems recruiting community governors and turn to the governance service for help. . They are often surprised when they are reminded that it is a governing body responsibility to recruit community governors. It is suggested that they write to local businesses, or place an advert in a local shop etc, One of their regular concerns is that they don't have the time to spend on active recruitment, and this point cannot be ignored as many governors are busy people taking on a very responsible role on top of their normal day-to-day commitments.
10. The Governance Service Manager has provided information on the methods currently and previously used to attract applicants to the role of governor. These include:
  - Advertising in 'Your Local Link' - a free advertising magazine. This magazine is used because they give the best advertising rates.
  - Press releases - used in the past when Local Authority vacancies became high. This was moderately successful, but the budget cannot support local press advertising charges.
  - Advertising space on year planners – this hasn't given much return and isn't a good use of the very limited budget.
  - Recruitment stand in the library - no responses received so not repeated
  - Volunteer recruitment drives with York Cares (otherwise known as speed dating) - recruited one governor as a result. However, at the time of the

last one they judged that our need wasn't as great as other organisations so we didn't get a slot at the speed dating session they ran.

11. On more than one occasion in the past the Governance Service team have tried to organise putting the stand up in supermarkets on a Saturday morning. Unfortunately, this required governor support to attend and talk to people, and the response was so poor that it didn't go ahead.
12. Any new ideas for recruitment drives need to bear in mind the question of capacity, as the governance team is just 2 x FTE, and this must be borne in mind if additional work, especially at weekends, is required.

### **Options**

13. Having considered the suggested remit and the information contained within this report, Members may choose to:
  - Agree the remit and timetable as proposed, or;
  - Amend and agree a revised remit and timetable

### **Implications**

14. There are no known Legal, Financial, HR, Equalities or other implications associated with the recommendations within this report.

### **Corporate Priorities**

15. Although the remit for this review does not fit directly with any of the Corporate Priorities, it could indirectly have a positive effect in relation to Corporate Priority No.7 – 'improve the life chances of the most disadvantaged and disaffected children, young people and families in the city'.

### **Risk Management**

16. Without the thorough engagement of current governors the findings from this review could be limited which in turn, could have a negative effect on the number of new applicants. Also, not keeping to the timetable agreed at this meeting, could affect the focus of the review and the progress of the Scrutiny Workplan.

### **Recommendations**

17. Members are asked to consider and agree the proposed remit, timetable and methods for progressing the review.

Reason: To ensure compliance with scrutiny procedures, protocols and workplans.

### **Contact Details**

**Author:**

Melanie Carr  
Scrutiny Officer  
Scrutiny Services

Tel No. 01904 552063

**Chief Officer Responsible for the report:**

Colin Langley  
Acting Head of Civic, Democratic & Legal Services

**Scoping Report Approved**

**Date** 16 October 2007

**Wards Affected:** *List wards or tick box to indicate all*

**All**

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:** None

**Annexes**

**Annex A** – Proposed Remit

**Annex B** – Table showing current composition of governing bodies

**Annex C** - Table of Governor types and information on recruitment responsibility

## **Review of Governing Bodies**

### **Remit**

In regard to Governing Bodies, to encourage an improved level of community involvement and maximise their diversity and skills

### **Key Objectives**

- i. To investigate the current composition of governing bodies with an effort to find ways of improving the ethnicity balance and chairing skills of panel members
- ii. To identify ways of increasing the number of community Governors
- iii. To identify ways of increasing community involvement with Governing Bodies
- iv. To investigate the role of Governors and current clerking arrangements in extended schools

This page is intentionally left blank

**GOVERNING BODY CONSTITUTION AND VACANCIES AS AT 15 OCTOBER 2007**

NB: The number in brackets represents the number of vacancies per category

Name	School Type	Head Teacher	Staff	LEA	Parent	Community	Foundation	Sponsor	Timeline for Vacancies
Acomb Primary	Primary	1	1	2(1)	4	4			1 x Jul 07 (LEA)
All Saints' RC School	Secondary	1	3	2	4	0	7		
Applefields	Special	1	2	3	6	5 (2)			1 x ?, 1 x Jul 07 (Community)
Archbishop Holgate's CE School	Secondary	1	3	2	3		11(2)		1x May 06, 1x Aug 07 (Foundation)
Archbishop of York's CE Junior	Primary	1	2	2	5 (2)	2	3		2x Oct 07 (Parent)
Badger Hill Primary School	Primary	1	2	3 (1)	5 (2)	3			1 x Aug 07 (LEA) 2 x Aug 07 (Parent)
Bishopthorpe Infant School	Primary	1	2	3	5	3			
Burnholme Community College	Secondary	1	3 (1)	4 (1)	7 (1)	5 (1)		2 (1)	1 x May 07 (Staff), 1 x Oct 07 (LEA), 1 x May 07 (Parent), 1 x May 07 (Community), 1 x Apr 07 (Sponsor)
Burton Green Primary School	Primary	1	1(1)	1	2	4	3 (1)		1 x Jul 07 (Staff), 1 x ? (Community)
Canon Lee School	Secondary	1	3	4	6 (2)	4			1 x Aug 07, 1 x Mar 06 (Parents)
Carr Infant School	Primary	1	2	2	4	3			1 x Jul 06, 1 x Mar 06 (Community)
Carr Junior School	Primary	1	2	2	4	3			
Clifton Green Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6	4			
Copmanthorpe Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6	4			
Dringhouses Primary School	Primary	1	3(2)	3	6	4			1x Oct 07, 1 x Feb 06 (Staff)
Dunnington CE Primary School	Primary	1	2	2	5	2	3		
Elvington CE Primary School	Primary	1	2	2(1)	5	2	3(1)		1 x Sept 07 (LEA), 1 x Jul 07 (Foundation)
Fed. of Derwent Infant & Derwent Junior Schools	Primary	1	4	3	6(1)	3			1 x Aug 07 (Parent)

Fed. of Our Lady's & English Martyrs' RC Primary School	Primary	1	4	2	2		11		
---	---------	---	---	---	---	--	----	--	--

Name	School Type	Head Teacher	Staff	LEA	Parent	Community	Foundation	Sponsor	Timeline for Vacancies
Fed. of Rawcliffe Infant & Clifton Without Junior Schools	Primary	1	3	4	7(1)	5(1)			1 x Aug 07 (Parent), 1 x Aug 06 (Community)
Fishergate Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	5	3			
Fulford School	Secondary	1	3	4	7	5(2)			1 x Oct 06, 1 x Jun 07 (Community)
Haxby Road Primary School	Primary	1	3	3 (2)	6 (2)	4 (3)			2 x Oct 07 (LEA), 1 x Oct 06, 1 x Aug 07, 1 x Sept 07 (Community), 2 x Sept 07 (Parents)
Headlands Primary School	Primary	1	3	3	6 (2)	3 (2)			1 x Apr 07, 1 x Oct 07 (Parent), 1 x Jul 06, 1 x ? (Community)
Hempland Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6	4(1)			1 x Oct 05 (Community)
Heworth CE Primary School	Primary	1	1	1	3		8		
Hob Moor Oaks Primary Special School	Special	1	2	3(1)	6 (1)	4(3)			1 x Sept 07 (LEA), 1 x Jun 07 (Parent), 1 x May 07, 1 x Jul 07, 1 x Sept 07 (Community)
Hob Moor Primary School	Primary	1(1)	3 (1)	4(1)	6(1)	4(2)			1 x Jun 07 (Headteacher), 1 x Aug 07 (Staff), 1 x Oct 07 (LEA), 1 x Jan 07 (Parent), 1 x Aug 07, 1 x May 07 (Community)
Huntington Primary School	Primary	1	3 (1)	4	6	4(2)			1 x Sept 07 (Staff), 1 x ?, 1 x Aug 07 (Community)
Huntington School	Secondary	1	3	4	7	5(1)			1 x ? (Community)
Joseph Rowntree School	Secondary	1	3	3	7(1)	2	4		1 x Jul 07 (Parent)
Knavesmire Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6(1)	4			1 x Oct 07 (Parent)
Lakeside Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	5	3(1)			1 x Sept 07 (Community)
Lord Deramore's Primary School	Primary	1	2	2	5(1)	2	3(1)		1 x Sept 07 (Parent), 1 x Jun 07 (Foundation)
Manor Church of England School	Secondary	1	3	4	3		11		
Millthorpe School	Secondary	1	3(1)	4(1)	7(1)	5(2)			1 x Jan 07 (Staff), 1 x Aug 07 (LEA), 1 x Sept 07 (Parent), 1 x Sept 07, 1 x Jun 07 (Community)
Naburn CE Primary School	Primary	1	1	2 (1)	4	2	2		1 x Oct 07 (LEA)

Name	School Type	Head Teacher	Staff	LEA	Parent	Community	Foundation	Sponsor	Timeline for Vacancies
New Earswick Primary School	Primary	1	2	1	1		7		
Osboldwick Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	5	3			
Park Grove Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	5	3 (1)			1 x Sept 07 (Community)
Poppleton Ousebank Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	6	5 (1)			1 x Sept 05 (Community)
Poppleton Road Primary School	Primary	1	3	3	6 (1)	4			1 x Oct 07 (Parent)
Ralph Butterfield Primary School	Primary	1	2 (1)	3	5	4 (2)			1 x Oct 07 (Staff), 2 x Oct 07 (Community)
Robert Wilkinson Primary School	Primary	1	2	2	6	3	4		
Rufforth Primary School	Primary	1	1	2	4	4			
Scarcroft Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6	4			
Skelton Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	5 (1)	3			1 x Jan 07 (Parent)
St Aelred's RC School	Primary	1	2	1	1	7 (1)			1 x Aug 07 (Foundation)
St Barnabas' CE School	Primary	1	2	2	5	2	3		
St George's RC School	Primary	1	3	1	2		9		
St Lawrence's CE Primary School	Primary	1	2	1	1		7		
St Mary's CE Primary School	Primary	1	1	1	4	2	2		
St Oswald's CE School	Primary	1	2	2	5	2	2		
St Paul's CE School	Primary	1	2	2 (2)	5	2	2		2 x Aug 07 (LEA)
St Paul's Nursery	Nursery	1	2	2	4	3			
St Wilfrid's RC School	Primary	1	2	1	1		7 (2)		1 x Aug 06, 1 x Jan 07 (Foundation)
Stockton-on-the-Forest Primary School	Primary	1	2 (2)	2	4	3			1 x Aug 05, 1 x Nov 05 (Staff)

Name	School Type	Head Teacher	Staff	LEA	Parent	Community	Foundation	Sponsor	Timeline for Vacancies
Tang Hall Primary School	Primary	1	2	2	4 (1)	3			1 x Jul 07 (Parent)
West of York Secondary School Temporary Governing Body	Secondary	1	3 (1)	3	6 (1)	4 (1)			1 x Oct 07 (Staff), 1 x Mar 07 (Parent), 1 x Jun 07 (Community)
Westfield Primary Community School	Primary	1	4	4	7 (2)	4 (1)			1 x Nov 06, 1 x Sept 07 (Parent), 1 x Sept 07 (Community)
Wheldrake CE Primary School	Primary	1	2	1	2		8 (2)		2 x Sept 07 (Foundation)
Wigginton Primary School	Primary	1	2	3	6 (1)	4 (1)			1 x Feb 07 (Parent), 1 x May 07 (Community)
Woodthorpe Primary School	Primary	1	3	4	6 (2)	4 (2)			1 x Aug 07, 1 x Oct 07 (Parent), 1 x Aug 06, 1 x Jul 07 (Community)
Yearsley Grove Primary	Primary	1	3 (1)	3	5 (1)	3			1 x Sept 07 (Staff), 1 x Sept 07 (Parent)
<b>Total of Category Types</b>		<b>64 (1)</b>	<b>154 (12)</b>	<b>171 (10)</b>	<b>310 (25)</b>	<b>200 (28)</b>	<b>110 (9)</b>	<b>2 (1)</b>	

This page is intentionally left blank

**Table Showing Different Governor Types & Recruitment Responsibilities**

Category Type	Responsibility For Recruitment of Governors	Support Currently Given By The School Governance Service
Staff	This is the responsibility of the Headteacher. However, occasionally there are difficulties	Advice only – suggest that headteachers consider membership of the GB as part of performance review in terms of job enhancement. Teachers and other staff can learn a lot by joining a governing body and this may be seen as a way of broadening their knowledge of education and the management of the school.
Local Education Authority	Arrangements for these are the responsibility of the School Governance Service. The School Governors One Stop Shop (SGOSS) occasionally send good applications through when they have someone who is wanting to be a governor in York. This is a government-funded agency which was originally set up to help LAs where governor vacancies were a major problem (this did not include York).	
Parents	Recruited by the school – governing Bodies need to be proactive in getting to parents' meetings and talking to prospective candidates prior to an election.	Provision of an information stand and information leaflets for parent evenings. Also, Succession Planning is a tool to try which would reduce the time lag between a parent governor leaving at the end of his/her term of office and a new person being elected.
Community	Appointed by the governing body and it is up to them to find suitable candidates. In practice, however, some schools stall on this and struggle.	The Governance Service can help if applications are received from individuals who want a particular school or area - but because finding LA governors is the responsibility of the Service Manager, and one of the service's performance indicators, filling LA vacancies takes priority. The service can help with advice.....but really it is up to the school to consider recruitment strategies.

Foundation	Appointed by the church or foundation and they are quite good at finding new candidates	Provision of leaflets if requested.
Sponsor	Sponsor governor places are in the instrument of government and intended to be filled from a named source, such as a Company or Trust. Where a company is named, the school will let them know if the governor leaves and it's then up to the Company) to get a governor to fill the vacancy.	
Associate	Associate members are not governors, they are members of governing bodies who are not part of the constitution (ie not included in the instrument of government). They are usually appointed by the governing body to bring specific expertise for a limited period of time – e.g. to sit on a working party to look at a specific issue. They can be given limited voting rights where they serve on committees and these rights are decided by the full governing body and may be withdrawn at any time. There is no requirement for governing bodies to have associate members and so there is no need for any involvement in recruitment.	